SHRI PABAN SINGH GHATOWAR : Sir, I have already said that the matter relating to the amendment in the Trade Union Act is already with the Standing Committee of both the Houses. Definitely, the Government will take note of the suggestion given by the hon. Member in this regard. ..*(Interruptions)*..

MR. CHAIRMAN : Now, Q. No. 684. Shri Pramod Mahajan.

SHRI E, BALANANADAN: Sir, I gave my name. I wanted to ask a specific question but you did not call me.

MR. CHAIRMAN : I am sorry, I have not seen the name.

Ban on export of Cattle to Bangladesh

*684. SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN :†
SHRI VIREN J. SHAH:

Will the Minister of COMMERCE be pleased to state :

(a) whether Government have banned the export of cattle from India to Bangladesh ;

(b) if so, what are the details in this regard ;

(c) whether it is a fact that there has been continuous smuggling of meat, milch and farm animals from India to Bangladesh as reported in the Sunday Observer of 22nd May, 1994 ;

(d) if so, what is the number and value of Indian heads of cattle which have been smuggled from India to Bangladesh during the year 1993 and so far in 1994 ; and

(e) what steps Government have taken or propose to take to check the illegal trade of cattle from India to Bangladesh ?

†The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Pramod Mahajan.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF COMMERCE (SHRI KAMALUDDIN AHMED) : (a) to (e) A Statement is laid on the Table of the House.

Statement

(a) and (b) As per the EXIM Policy 1992-97, export of beef is prohibited, while export of cattle is restricted and permitted only under licence. The Export Licensing Committee has approved licences for the export of 1,33,000 buffaloes of non-descript breed for export to Bangladesh during 1993-94, subject to certain conditions.

(c) and (d) Available reports do indicate that there is some smuggling of cattle from India to Bangladesh. Details on the quantity and value of Indian cattle seized on the border are as follows :—

Year	No. of heads of Indian cattle seized	Value (Rs. in lakhs)
1993	22915	216.71
1994 (upto April)	6938	83.84

(e) The Border Security Force (BSF) has intensified surveillance and has been strengthened for keeping a closer vigil at the border. The field formations under the Ministry of Finance have also been suitably alerted to maintain constant vigil to check such smuggling of cattle across the border.

श्री प्रमोद महाजन : अध्यक्ष जी, यह भाग्य विडंबना है कि बांग्लादेश भारत में मनुष्यों की अर्थात् घुसपैठियों की तस्करी करता है और भारत से बांग्लादेश में पशु-धन की तस्करी होती है और दुर्भाग्य यह है कि भारत की सरकार न उधर से आने वाले मनुष्य की तस्करी को रोकती है और न यहां

से होने वाली पशु की तस्करी को रोकती है। समाचार पत्रों के अनुसार बांग्लादेश सरकार ने अनाधिकृत रूप से इसे उनकी आयात नीति का हिस्सा बना लिया और भारतीय पशु-धन पर 700 से 1500 टका तक आयात शुल्क लगाया है और गत 6 महीनों में बांग्लादेश सरकार ने लगभग 15 करोड़ टका इस पर शुल्क इकट्ठा किया है। इस स्थिति को देखते हुए मैं वाणिज्य मंत्री से यह पूछना चाहूंगा कि क्या भारत सरकार बांग्लादेश में भारत से किसी भी प्रकार का निर्यात करने के लिए किसी को भी अनुमति नहीं देगी और क्या बांग्लादेश के साथ पशु-धन निर्यात को पूर्ण रूप से निषिद्ध किया जाएगा?

THE MINISTER OF COMMERCE (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE) : Sir, so far as the trade of cattle is concerned, I have explained in the statement itself that it is permitted under licence and 1,33,000 cattle of non-descript breed are to be exported. All these are buffaloes; not cows, because we do not allow export of cows. We do not know what would be the end-use even though sometimes the demand is for dairy purposes. But as there cannot be control on the end-use, we do not allow export of cows.

So far as the smuggling and the news-item are concerned, I do not know whether the Bangladesh Government has imposed any duty on smuggled cattle. To my mind, this is a news item.

SHRI PROMOD MAHAJAN There is a tax....(*Interruptions*)....

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: I am coming to that. Whether you use the word tax' or 'duty', it is the same, However what you say is unusual; I do not believe that any Government can impose a duty or a tax on smuggled items. So, this matter will be taken up by our Ministry of External Affairs which is the nodal ministry from our-side. Co-Chairman of the Indo-Bangladesh Joint Commission and in the next meeting of the Joint Working Group this matter will be taken up. Before that, ...(*interruption*)....

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : Which matter ?

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Whether this news-item which appeared in the *Sunday Observer* is a fact or not.

So far as the smuggling port is concerned, it is a fact. But regarding the matter, whether Bangladesh has legally imposed any duty or not, I request the hon. Member not to rush to any conclusion unless the fact is verified, because you are raising an accusing finger against a friendly Government, who is our neighbour.

श्री प्रमोद महाजन : अध्यक्ष जी, बांगला देश में पशुधन नहीं के बराबर है और वाणिज्य मंत्री जी यह जानते हैं कि बांगला देश गौ-मांस का सबसे प्रमुख निर्यातिक देश है। जिस देश में गौ है ही नहीं, वह देश जब दुनिया का सबसे बड़ा गौ-मांस निर्यातिक देश बन जाता है तो इसका अर्थ स्पष्ट है कि भारत से गायों की वहां तस्करी हो रही है। इसीलिए मैंने आपसे पूछा था, जिसका उत्तर मुझे मिला नहीं। आप पहले वह उत्तर दें। क्या आप पशुधन के निर्यात पर पूर्ण रोक लगाएंगे? इसका आपने उत्तर नहीं दिया। उन्होंने मुझे सलाह दी कि बांगलादेश के साथ क्या बात करनी चाहिए। आपसे मैंने पहला प्रश्न पूछा था। ... (व्यवधान)... My first supplementary was : Will you totally prohibit it ? You first answer that question. Then I can put to you further questions. He has not answered my previous supplementary.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: So far as putting a ban on the export of cattle is concerned, my answer is 'No'. I have put it in the negative list and the hon. Member would appreciate that I cannot put a ban in respect of any particular country ?

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : Why ?

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: No, it is not desirable. I can put a ban on a particular commodity, for example, cow. I can put a ban that cow cannot be exported to any country. But it would not be desirable to say that cows could be exported to some countries and they could not be exported to some other countries, particularly when our relationship with Bangladesh is one of most favoured nation treatment and the most favoured nation treatment entails upon the country that the treatment which you extend to country 'A' will have to be extended to country 'B'. Therefore, the question of putting a ban on export of cattle to Bangladesh is not possible. As I have mentioned in the text of my answer, they are being exported under licence and under certain conditions. Those conditions are to be fulfilled. The condition is about the health certificate; the condition is about the movement; the condition is about getting a certificate from the end-users, whatever little value it may have. My request to the hon. Member related only to the allegation part; otherwise, the hon. Member is free to put any supplementary which he wants to put. There is no objection. But I think we should not rush to the conclusion of putting the Government of a friendly country in the dock by raising an accusing finger.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Second supplementary. (*Interruptions*)....

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : When he has not answered the first, there cannot be a second supplementary. He will have to answer the first. then only the second will start.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Will you put your second supplementary ? You need not explain to the other people.

श्री प्रमोद महाजन : सभापति जी, सरकार ने स्वयं माना है कि तस्करी होती है और लगभग सरकार ने यह कहा है कि 30,000 पशुओं को वहां पकड़ा गया है। मैं सिर्फ यह जानना चाहता हूं कि इस संबंध में क्या बांगला देश सरकार से इससे पहले कभी कोई बात हुई ? उसका क्या निष्कर्ष निकला ? आपने जो शर्तें रखी हैं, उन शर्तों के बारे में जानना चाहूंगा कि यह कौनसी शर्तें हैं ? इसमें अगर यह शर्त हो कि उसका गौ-मांस निर्यात नहीं होगा इन-यूज, तो यह शर्त बांगला देश, जो अपना बहुत ही अच्छा मित्र देश है, यह आखिरी शर्त वह मान रहा है, यह देखने की भारत सरकार के पास क्या व्यवस्था है ?

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: So far as the condition of export is concerned, it should be for breeding purposes and for dairy purposes. That is the certificate which they will have to get. Sometimes it becomes very difficult logistically. One would appreciate that ultimately it is very difficult to go and supervise it in that country unless we get a specific complaint. Let us be very practical. Is it possible for anybody to go and check what happened to 1,33,000 of cattle. Can the hon. Member give me any mechanism through which I can do it ? I will be able to accept it.

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : Why are you putting conditions which you cannot implement ?

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: The conditions are on what we grant the licence because we allow it only for dairy and breeding purposes. Regarding the second question of smuggling.... (*Interruptions*) Sir, I am on my legs. I am not entering into any argument on this. He has put a question and I have given my reply to the best of my ability. Let him not educate me. Therefore, my point is that I have stated in the first part of the reply that we have exported this much quantum. There are conditions. Health certificates are to be provided. The purpose for which these are being exported is to be certified and in respect of movements the provisions of the various laws which are followed by the State Governments are to be followed. The movement of cattle is within the jurisdiction of the State Government. Sir, a large number of commodities and cattle are being smuggled into that country because of the long border. So, whenever there is an exchange of views, apart from normal trade negotiations and bilateral meetings at the joint working group level, these things are being discussed. We have strengthened the enforcement machinery by deploying the border security forces, by having more outposts, by patroling, etc. All these traditional methods are taken into account.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Question Hour is over.

WRITTEN ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

पब्लिक यूटीलिटी कमीशन की स्थापना

*685. **प्रो० विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा :**
श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज :

क्या नागरिक आपूर्ति, उपभोक्ता मामलें और सार्वजनिक वितरण मंत्री यह बताने की कृपा करेंगे कि :

(क) क्या सरकार ने आम उपभोक्ता के हितों की रक्षा करने के लिए राष्ट्रीय स्तर पर पब्लिक यूटीलिटी कमीशन स्थापित करने के संबंध में कोई निर्णय लिया है ;

(ख) यदि हां, तो तत्संबंधी ब्यौरा क्या है ;

(ग) यदि इस संबंध में अब तक कोई निर्णय नहीं लिया गया है, तो इसमें विलम्ब के क्या कारण हैं ; और

(घ) भविष्य में कब तक कमीशन गठित किये जाने की संभावना है ?

नागरिक पूर्ति, उपभोक्ता मामलें और सार्वजनिक वितरण मंत्री (श्री ए.के. एंटनी) : (क से (घ) सरकार इसकी जांच कर रही है। तथापि, पब्लिक यूटीलिटी कमीशन स्थापित करने के बारे में निर्णय केवल संबंधित मंत्रालयों/विभागों और राज्य सरकारों के साथ परामर्श के बाद ही लिया जा सकता है।

Bill regarding pension scheme for PF contributors

*686. SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA :
SHRI JALALUDDIN ANSARI :

Will the Minister of LABOUR be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government have completed its talks with various trade unions on the proposed Bill regarding introduction of a pension scheme for the provident fund contributors; and

(b) if so, by when the Bill is expected to be brought before Parliament ?

THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH